## Second Central Asia Regional Public Procurement Forum, Almaty, April 11-14, 2006

#### **Conclusions and Recommendations**

The Second Central Asia Public Procurement Forum was held in Almaty from April 11 to 14, 2006. The list of participants is attached at Annex A.

The main objective of the Forum was to provide a platform to the senior public procurement officials from Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan and Uzbekistan for exchanging their experiences and ideas for continuous improvement (both from the perspective of the regulatory environment and of best practices) in the public procurement systems. This objective was substantially met.

The Forum reviewed the implementation of the recommendations on the Action Plan for 2005-2006 of the First Forum held in Tashkent in April 2005, and decided on the Action Plan for 2006-2007. The participants concluded that all the recommendations of the First Forum could not all be implemented as the senior public procurement officials of the participating countries were preoccupied with the improvements in their legislative and regulatory framework and in improving implementation of the recently enacted public procurement laws.

The Forum was opened by the Regional Director of the World Bank for Central Asia and the Chairman of Committee for Financial Controls and Statement Procurement (host) who emphasized the importance of public procurement for the economic and efficient use

## Kazakhstan

- 1. Anuarbek Sultangazin, Chairman, Committee for Public Procurement and Financial Control, Ministry of Finance, 11 Pobedy Ave., 010000 Astana, Tel: 7 (3172) 71-71-71
- 2. Nurlan Ospanov, Deputy Chairman, Committee for Public Procurement and

## **Action Plan for Regional Cooperation for 2006-2007**

Establishment of the Regional Group on public procurement to ensure regular,

Detailed Procurement Plan (with the methods of selection specified) (KG, KZ) Publication of the procurement plans on the web-site and in the Bulletin (increases transparency and minimizes the level of corruption, KG,KZ) Annual independent;

Register/Log of entities subject to Public Procurement (KZ)

Decentralization of procurement functions to the procuring entities;

#### **Examples of Inefficiencies**

Lack of competence of the Tender Committee Members;

Poor quality of tender docs;

Multiple and scattered public procurement regulators (by laws and other docs, etc.)

Absence of the unified body responsible for public procurement policy; Absence of qualified trainers;

#### **Recommendations for Minimizing Corruption**

Minimizing communication with the officials. E-Procurement.

Minimizing human fact

Distribution of functions among public procurement departments and tender committees;

Decrease number of by-laws related to public procurement;

Decrease number of sole sourcing;

Contract administration/management;

#### **Recommendations For Improving Efficiency of Public Procurement**

Establishment of the centralized monitoring system. Provide an access to the Register of entities subject to public procurement for other countries;

To recommend to the Republic of Tajikistan upon passage of the Law to enforce the work on development of legislative regulatory documents for law implementation with the help of the WB and experts from CA countries;

To improve qualification of staff;

Certification of the specialists (for TJ);

Regional Training Center is to develop the TOT program (taking into account law adjustments

To increase the number of Forum participants

Banner exchange, bulletins exchange, exchange of regional news, legislative regulatory data base.

<u>Group 3</u>: This Group considered the capacity issues in public procurement and made recommendations for enhancing the role of civil society to ensure propriety in this area.

# Recommendations for Public Procurement Capacity Building and Enhancing the role of Civil Society in Public Procurement

Motivation of Civil servants

Creation of websites and issuance of information periodicals

Briefings and Seminars for Private Sector

Budget allocation for education and training (procuring entities)

Development of learning programs for training-the-trainer (authorized body);

Special courses on public procurement in Universities (Ministry of Education and Authorized Body);

Use of existing training organizations (Authorized Body);

Government of existing learning modules (Authorized Body and Kyrgyz Regional Training Center);

Development of learning and methodology materials (Authorized Body and Regional Training Center);

Development of cooperation mechanisms with Civil Society and Private Sector;

Briefings, meetings and discussion with civil society;

Increasing awareness of civil society and private sector

Participants agreed with the recommendations of Groups 2 and 3 to be followed up by the respective countries.

## Agenda

April 11, Tuesday (DAY 1) Chair: Kazakhstan			
9:00 - 09:30 am	REGISTRATION		
9:30	Opening Session	Welcome and opening remarks by Ms. Annette Dixon, Acting Country Director, Central Asia Regional Office, the World Bank, Almaty	
	Welcome remarks	by Mr. Sultangazin, Chairman of the Committee for Financial Control and State Procurement, Ministry of Finance	
10:30 - 11:00 am	Coffee Break		
11:00 - 12:00 pm	Public Procurement in Central Asia since the Tashkent Forum (2005); and Importance of Public Procurement to Budget Execution	Mr. Sunil K. Bhattacharya, Acting Director Operations, Policy and Services Unit, and Regional Procurement Manager for Europe and Central Asia, the World Bank, followed by Question and Answer Session	
12:00- 1:00 pm	Pre-requisites of a sound public procurement system	Ms. Francoise Bentchikou, Chief Counsel,	

11:30 1:00 pm	Country Presentation (Uzbekistan)	Ms. Kamila Bakaeva, Lead Specialist, Ministry of Foreign Relations and Trade, following by Question and Answer Session
1:00 2:30 pm	Lunch Break	

#### **List of Participants**

#### Republic of Uzbekistan:

- 1. Abror Azizov, Head, the Department for Competitive Bidding in Construction, State Architecture and Construction Committee.
- 2. Bakhtiyor Umarov, Lead Economist, Department for Foreign Currency Financing, Main Currency Department, Ministry of Finance.
- 3. Kamila Bakaeva, Lead Specialist, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Economic Relations, Investments and Trade
- 4. Georgiy Khachiev, Coordinator, Center for Economic Reseach
- 5. Anvar Ikramov, Deputy Head, Department for Legal Examination, Legal Support to Entrepreneurship, Chamber of Commerce and Industry.
- 6. Bakhtiyor Abdusamatov, General Director, "Uzbektenderconsulting" Agency

#### Republic of Tajikistan:

- 1. Hamdam Tagaimurodov, Director, Agency on Procurement of Goods, Works and Services under the Ministry of Economy and Trade
- 2. Faiziddin Kahorov, Deputy Director, Agency on Procurement of Goods, Works and Services under the Ministry of Economy and Trade
- 3. Khairullo Khojaev, Regional Representative of the Agency on Procurement of Goods, Works and Services under the Ministry of Economy and Trade in Rasht Valley
- 4. Abdukarim Rahimov, Head of Department on State Reserves and Public Procurement, Ministry of Economy and Trade
- 5. Nasimjon Pirmatov, Head of Department for Monitoring Economic Sectors, Ministry of Finance

#### The Kyrgyz Republic:

- 1. Gumasarlyk Nurjanov, Chairman, State Agency on Procurement and Material Reserves
- 2. Zamirbek Esenamanov, Deputy of Parliament (Jogorky Kenesh)
- 3. Akylbek Oumetaliev, Director of the Regional Procurement Training Center
- 4. Saina Abdumomunova, Head of Control Department, State Agency on Procurement and Material Reserves
- 5. Jyldyz Sydykova, Specialist, State Agency on Procurement and Material Reserves
- 6. Temirlan Baimursaev, Lawyer, State Agency on Procurement and Material Reserves

#### Republic of Kazakhstan:

- 1. Anuarbek Sultangazin, Chairman of the Committee for Financial Control and Public Procurement (CFCPP), Ministry of Finance
- 2. Nurlan Ospanov, Deputy Chairman, CFCPP
- 3. Ardak Turgankulov, Director of the E-Trade Center
- 4. Asemgul Essimova, Deputy Director of the E

#### NGOs (from Almaty):

- 1.
- 2. Kalima Umakhan, Public Policy Research Center
- 3. Sofia Aisagalieva, Forum of Entrepreneurs
- 4. Sergey Zlotnikov, Transparency KZ

#### **Donors:**

- 1. Zhanar Sagimbayeva, UNDP
- 2. Alma Byuirakulova, UNDP
- 3. Andrian Van Der Meer, EC/EU/TACIS
- 4. Ulan Abylgaziev, IDB
- 5. Ainoura Byrmyza, DFID

#### ILO-ITC (Turin) - Valeriy Malotchko

#### World Bank:

- 1. Annette Dixon, Acting Country Director
- 2. Sunil Bhattacharya, ECSPS Manager
- 3. Françoise Bentchikou, Chief Counsel
- 4. Naushad Khan, Lead Procurement Specialist
- 5. Paul Schapper, Senior E-Procurement Expert
- 6. Nurbek Kurmanaliev, Procurement Analyst
- 7. Fasliddin Rakhimov, Procurement Analyst
- 8. Dilshod Karimova, Program Assistant
- **9.** Anara Akhmetova, Program Assistant